

DRAFT MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

December 15, 2011, 10:00 a.m.

Halsey Lecture Hall, Virginia Historical Society, 2801 Kensington Avenue, Richmond, VA 23221

State Review Board Members Present

Dr. Elizabeth Moore, Chairperson
Dr. Laurantett Lee, Vice-Chairperson
Jody Lahendro
Dr. Gabrielle Lanier
John Metz
Jim Wootton

Historic Resources Board Members Present

Jeanne Evans-Cox, Chairperson
Ora McCoy, Vice-Chairperson
Lacy Ward
James Rich
Helen Murphy
Bill Garner
Bob Johnson

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director
Marc Wagner
Ann Andrus
Amy Moses
Megan Melinat
Dr. Catherine Slusser
Michael Pulice
Dr. Bob Carter
Lena McDonald
Wendy Musumeci

Joanie Evans
Kristin Kirchen
Peter Luebke
David Edwards
Joanna Wilson Green
Elizabeth Tune
Pam Schenian
Jennifer Hugman
Gillian Bearn
David Edwards

Guests (from sign in sheet): Sandi Esposito, Clifford-New Glasgow and Macedonia Methodist Church; John Elliker, USS *Wisconsin*; Edward Hanzlik, Church of the Sacred Heart; Mary Gainer, NASA Langley Research Center; Caroline Diehl, NASA Langley Research Center; David Brown, DATA Inc; W. Scott Smith, Fifth Street Historic District, Updyke Farm, and Clifford-New Glasgow Historic District; Llewellyn Hensley, General Electric Plant; Brian Hannigan, Dominion Hills Historic District.

State Review Board (SRB)

Chair Elizabeth Moore called the State Review Board meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. She read the role of the board, explaining the process of designation, and asked the other members to introduce themselves. She then presented the September 2011 meeting minutes. With a motion from Mr. Metz and a second from Ms. Lanier, the Board voted unanimously to accept the minutes.

Historic Resources Board (HRB)

Chair Jeanne Evans-Cox called the Historic Resources Board meeting to order. She explained the role of the board and asked each member to introduce themselves. She then presented the September 2011 meeting minutes. With a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Mr. Ward, the Board unanimously approved the minutes.

With a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Mr. Johnson, the board voted Ms. Evans-Cox as Chair and Mr. Rich as Vice-Chair.

Director's Report (DHR)

Director Kilpatrick welcomed everyone in attendance. She noted that board training had been held at the Robert Russa Moton School in Farmville in November and then introduced two new staff members at DHR, register historian Lena McDonald and easement stewardship coordinator Gillian Bearn. The director acknowledged the numerous interns currently working with DHR and discussed the million dollars' worth of grants that will support multiple Civil War battlefield preservation groups, all of which will result in easements. She mentioned several conferences in which DHR has been involved over the past year, including the Preservation Virginia conference in Winchester this past September. She noted that DHR plans to participate in the upcoming Environmental Conference. Kilpatrick then highlighted a few

accomplishments from the last quarter including the designation of Fort Monroe as a national monument, the commendable efforts of staff working with homeowners affected by the August 2011 earthquake and hurricane, and the publication of two books, Martha McCartney's *Jordan's Point* and Michael Pulice's *Nineteenth-Century Brick Architecture in the Roanoke Valley and Beyond: Discovering the True Legacies of the Deyerle Buildings*. Kilpatrick also mentioned the upcoming announcement of the governor's budget and that the focus of the budget would be on education, public safety, and the state retirement system. She discussed Virginia's high ranking in the number of buildings and districts listed on the National Register and called board members' attention to the NPS response letter to the Forest Hill nomination appeal, a copy of which was included in the the board members' folders. She noted that DHR would continue to work with the sponsors on edits, and that the revised nomination might be reconsidered in March. Finally, she gave the boards a brief summary of the day's agenda.

Ms. Kirchen presented the following nominations for the Capital Region:

Church of the Sacred Heart, Prince George County, Criterion A with Consideration A
Clifford-New Glasgow Historic District, Amherst County, Criteria A and C
Fifth Street Historic District, City of Lynchburg, Criteria A and C
Macedonia Methodist Church, Amherst County, Criterion C

Ms. Evans presented the following nominations for the Northern Region:

Dominion Hills Historic District, Arlington County, Criteria A and C
General Electric Specialty Control Plant, City of Waynesboro, Criteria A and B
Old Denton, Fauquier County, Criterion C

Ms. Schenian presented the following nomination for the Tidewater Region:

NASA Langley Research Center, City of Hampton, Criteria A and C with Consideration G
U.S.S. *Wisconsin*, City of Norfolk, Criteria A and C with Consideration G

Mr. Pulice presented the following nominations for the Western Region:

J.M. Updyke Farm, Bland County, Criterion C

Comments made:

With a motion from Mr. Wootton and a second from Mr. Lahendro, the State Review Board voted unanimously to accept the nominations as presented. With a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Mr. Rich, the Historic Resources Board voted unanimously to approve the nominations as presented.

Chair Moore adjourned the joint meeting.

MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

December 12, 2011

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD (HRB)

Board of Historic Resources Members Present

Jeanne Evans-Cox, Chair
William Garner
Robert Johnson
Ora McCoy, Vice-Chair
Helen Turner Murphy
James Rich

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Gillian Bearn
Joanna Wilson Green
Director Kilpatrick
Peter Luebke
Megan Melinat
Wendy Musumeci
Elizabeth Tune

Chair Evans-Cox brought the HRB back to order at 11:45 a.m.

Mr. Luebke presented the following highway markers for approval:

1. Blockhouses near Jamestown

Sponsor: Alain Outlaw/James City County Historical Commission

Locality: James City County

Proposed Location: Jamestown Road, .35 miles from Jamestown Ferry Landing

2. Community of Grove

Sponsor: Alain Outlaw/James City County Historical Commission

Locality: James City County

Proposed Location: 8660 Pocahontas Trail

3. Ebenezer Baptist Church

Sponsor: Mr. Willie Carr, Chairman of the Trustee Board, Ebenezer Baptist Church

Locality: City of Richmond

Proposed Location: 216 West Leigh Street

4. Lafayette at Corbin's Bridge

Sponsor: Elizabeth Couture/Mine Run DAR Chapter

Locality: Spotsylvania County

Proposed Location: Pull-off on NW side of intersection of Catharpin Road (Rte. 612) and Brock Road (Rte. 613)

5. Weddell-McCabe-Chisholm House

Sponsor: The Cameron Foundation

Locality: City of Petersburg

Proposed Location: 228 South Sycamore Street

6. Naval Actions on Wilton Creek and the Rappahannock River

Sponsor: Deltaville Maritime Museum
Locality: Middlesex County
Proposed Location: Intersection of Rte.33 and Woodport Lane

7. Henry “Box” Brown

Sponsor: Louisa County Historical Society/Allen Jennings
Locality: Louisa County
Proposed Location: Rte. 33 near The Hermitage plantation

Diversity Markers (TEA-21)

8. Cornelia Storrs Adair

Sponsor: DHR
Locality: TBD
Proposed Location: TBD

9. Daniel Webster Davis

Sponsor: DHR
Locality: City of Richmond
Proposed Location: Near 910 N. 7th Street

10. Frank Trigg

Proposed by: Jane White
Sponsor: DHR
Locality: City of Lynchburg
Proposed Location: 1422 Pierce Street

11. Morgan v. Virginia

Sponsor: DHR
Locality: Middlesex County
Proposed Location: Near Saluda

12. Laura Lu Scherer Copenhaver

Sponsor: DHR
Locality: Marion
Proposed Location: 245 W. Main, Marion

13. Samuel L. Gravely Jr.

Sponsor: DHR
Locality: City of Richmond
Proposed Location: near his childhood home in Fulton

Updates to an Approved Marker

14. Elizabeth Hobbs Keckley

Mr. Garner requested several minor changes and clarifications to be made in markers 1,2, 5, and 9. With a motion from Mr. Rich and a second from Ms. McCoy, the board approved all the markers and updates contingent upon completion of the requested changes.

Ms. Musumeci then presented the following easement items, noting that the Old Business of the Fussell’s Mill Tract/Deep Bottom II would be considered in the afternoon:

Easement Donations for Consideration

1. Fairfield Plantation Archaeological Site, Gloucester County (44GL0024)
Donor: Stacy B. Lloyd, III
Land Included: 223.5 acres

2. Rectortown Warehouse, Rectortown H.D., Fauquier County (030-5155-0002)

Donor: John Randolph Embrey & Shirley C. Embrey

Land Included: 0.5768 acres

3. Lynwood (Heatwole) Property, Port Republic Battlefield, Rockingham County (082-5430)

Donor: Gerald and Anita Heatwole

Land Included: 429.33 acres

4. Saunders Station, U.S. Post Office, W. Broad Street Commercial H.D., City of Richmond (127-0782 & 127-5807-0015)

Donor: United States Postal Service

Land Included: lot

5. Point of Rocks, Chesterfield County (020-0123)

Donor: County of Chesterfield

Land Included: 29.98 acres

6. Hudson Property, Cedar Creek Battlefield, Frederick and Warren Counties (093-0106)

Donor: Belle Grove, Inc.

Land Included: 11 acres

7. Belroi Lots, Gloucester County

Donor: Belroi Road, LLC

Land Included: 7 acres

8. Schooley Mill Barn, Waterford H.D., Loudoun County (401-0033)

Donor: Waterford Foundation, Inc.

Land Included: 20.02 acres

Assignment/Transfer of Easement]

9. Virginia National Textron Tract, Cool Springs Battlefield, Clarke County

Donor: Civil War Trust

Land Included: 195.3658 acres

Comments made:

Mr. Rich received confirmation that an easement on #6 would prohibit subdivision. Mr. Johnson and Mr. Rich asked for some clarification on the easement program and the state's responsibility for #8. Chair Evans-Cox expressed her view that #9 had lost integrity, and thus should not be accepted. Ms. Musumeci provided clarification, noting that a golf course had resulted in land displacement. Director Kilpatrick added that staff needed to visit the property before firm guidance could be provided by DHR and made the Board aware of the deadlines for a Land and Water Conservation Fund (LWCF) grant the property holder was seeking. After discussion, with a motion from Mrs. Murphy and a second from Mr. Garner, the board voted to defer a decision on #9 until the March 2012 meeting. With a motion from Vice-Chair McCoy and a second from Mr. Rich, the board voted to accept items #1-#8.

Ms. Musumeci then presented the following to the board:

1. Easement Policy #11: Appraisals

Comments made: Ms. Musumeci explained the new policy statement to the Board. Chair Evans-Cox stated that staff had previously been asked by the Board to review all easement program policies and to revise them to meet current standards. She pointed out that the new policy was the latest to be presented to the Board. Ms. Musumeci remarked that this was a new policy rather than a revision of an existing policy. Chair Evans-Cox agreed, but stated that it was still part of the Board's original request to staff.

With a motion from Mr. Rich and a second from Vice Chair McCoy, the new policy was approved.

Mr. Garner then asked whether the new policy had received the approval of the Office of the Attorney General (OAG). Ms. Musumeci stated that staff had presented the policy for review and approval but had not yet received a reply. Director Kilpatrick commented that the new policy was consistent with similar policies adopted by DHR's sister easement holding agencies and with current state tax policy and procedure. Ms. Musumeci noted that the policy would be brought back to the Board at the March 2012 meeting if there were any concern or significant changes as a result of an OAG review. Mr. Garner asked whether the provision for 30 days' review of Form 8283 was sufficient. Ms. Musumeci stated that it was sufficient, if sometimes unrealistic. She said that exceptions could be made if necessary, but that a longer review period would result in complaints from property owners.

Ms. Musumeci briefed the Board on the following easements recorded since the September 2011 meeting:

Easements Recorded Since the September 2011 Meeting:

- 1. Stonewall Cemetery Tracts, Second Manassas Battlefield, Prince William County (076-5190-0001)**
Donor: SCI Virginia Funeral Services, Inc.
Date Recorded: October 3, 2011
Land Included: 5.185 acres

- 2. Spiker Property, Tom's Brook Battlefield, Shenandoah County (085-5045-0004)**
Donor: R.D. Investments, L.C. and Robert L. Spiker, Jr.
Date Recorded: October 26, 2011
Land Included: 211.849 acres
[Co-held with Shenandoah Valley Battlefields Foundation]

- 3. Cave Hill Farm, Rockingham County (082-0386)**
Donor: Cave Hill Farm, L.L.C. (John Hopkins III and Helen Hopkins)
Date Recorded: November 30, 2011
Land Included: 2.291 acres

- 4. Anchorage Farm, Albemarle County (002-0734)**
Donor: David H. and Nancy K. Bass
Date Recorded: December 1, 2011
Land Included: 84 acres

Comments made: Ms. Musumeci gave a brief synopsis of the late September Board training session that took place at the Moton School in Farmville on November 9th. She referenced the new Easement Program Manual, a copy of which was given to each Board member. Ms. Musumeci stated that easement staff planned to schedule an easement training session for all Board members in early 2012.

Chair Evans-Cox adjourned the meeting at 12:45 p.m. to the call of the Chair. The HRB reconvened at 1:30 p.m.

Board of Historic Resources Members Present

Jeanne Evans-Cox, Chair
William Garner
Robert Johnson
Ora McCoy, Vice-Chair
Helen Turner Murphy
James Rich

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Gillian Bearn
Joanna Wilson Green
Director Kilpatrick
Peter Luebke
Megan Melinat
Wendy Musumeci
Elizabeth Tune

Guests: Ben Brockenbrough, Richmond Battlefields Association Property Chair

Mrs. Wilson Green then presented the following easement item

CONSENT AGENDA:

A. Old Business:

1. Fussell's Mill, Deep Bottom II Battlefield, Henrico County (043-5256)

Donor: Richmond Battlefields Association

Land Included: 31 acres

[American Battlefield Protection Program Grant]

Comments made:

Mrs. Wilson Green briefed the Board on the significance of the property and provided background information about the project. Mrs. Wilson Green noted that staff contacted Henrico County about the proposed easement and its consistency with the County's Comprehensive Plan. Henrico County responded with a letter informing staff that the Comprehensive Plan contained plans to widen Yahley Mill Road, which is adjacent to the property, and may require up to a 60 foot right-of-way. The County also mentioned that it planned to install a buried water/sewer line through the property. Mrs. Wilson Green emphasized that the water/sewer project is not identified in the current Comprehensive Plan. She reviewed Section 10.1-1701 of the Open-Space Land Act with the Board and pointed out that this section of the Code of Virginia requires use of the property for open-space land to be consistent with the official Comprehensive Plan for the locality. Because the water/sewer project is not within the Comprehensive Plan, it falls outside of these requirements.

Mr. Ben Brockenbrough, Chair of the Richmond Battlefields Association Property Committee, then spoke on behalf of the Association. Mr. Brockenbrough stated that he had met with County officials about the proposed easement and that the County's position thus far has been that their need for a right-of-way across the property for the water/sewer line is non-negotiable. Chair Evans-Cox and Mrs. Murphy asked Mr. Brockenbrough and Mrs. Wilson Green questions regarding Henrico County's general plans for the development of the area and their impact on the battlefield. Mr. Brockenbrough discussed alternatives to the buried sewer line, and Mrs. Wilson Green discussed the information contained in the comprehensive plan.

Director Kilpatrick observed that the Code of Virginia requires the Board to take into account public projects and asked if staff had consulted with the Office of the Attorney General. Mrs. Wilson Green replied no, that staff wanted to obtain the input of the Board first. Director Kilpatrick inquired what other alternatives for the water/sewer line had been considered. Mr. Brockenbrough replied that the County offered to relocate the line to the east side of an existing pond, which would still significantly impact battlefield land. Chair Evans-Cox asked if the east side of the pond was still part of the battlefield and requested confirmation that this portion of the parcel had historic significance. Mr. Brockenbrough replied in the affirmative.

Chair Evans-Cox stated that she was concerned about the legalities of this situation that may lead to a dispute. Director Kilpatrick commented that it was clear the Board had to take into account the road widening and the language in the easement would reflect and allow for the taking, but that it was not legally obligated to take into account the water/sewer line in the easement deed. She asked that the Board provide a statement to Henrico County affirming the historic significance of the property and the public benefit of its preservation and requesting that the County examine feasible alternatives.

After discussion, the Board arrived at the following statement: “The Board acknowledges the historical importance of the Property [the easement under consideration of 31 acres at Fussell’s Mill/Deep Bottom II], that Henrico County is aware of the importance and the Board supports the preservation in perpetuity of the Property and admonishes the County to explore feasible alternatives [for the proposed sewer line] that would protect this valuable resource for the benefit of the public.”

With a motion from Mr. Rich and a second from Mrs. Murphy the statement was approved.

The HRB was adjourned to the call of the Chair at 2:10 p.m.

STATE REVIEW BOARD

Chair Moore brought the meeting to order at 1:40 p.m. in the Department of Historic Resources Study Collections Room for discussion and consideration of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

Board Members (b) and Staff (s) present: Jody Lahendro (b), Gabrielle Lanier (b), Laurant Lee (b), John Metz (b), Elizabeth Moore (b), Jim Wootton (b), Ann Andrus (s), David Edwards (s), Joanie Evans (s), Jennifer Hugman (s), Kristin Kirchen (s), Lena McDonald (s), Amy Moses (s), Mike Pulice (s), Pam Schenian (s), Marc Wagner (s).

Guests (from sign in sheet): David Brown and Joseph Reid, Riverlawn; Robert White and Marcus Pollard, Campbell’s Bridge Mill Worker Historic District; Rhea Hale, Farmer’s Rest; Laurie Turkawski, Holly Knoll.

Item for Discussion

Riverlawn, Mathews County, Mathews Quad, 057-0036, Criterion C

Wagner began the discussion by giving an overview of the reasons staff had made a recommendation of ineligibility for Riverlawn. Reasons included a weak association with former owners Heron Campbell Murray and John J. Burke, and a lack of integrity due mostly to replacement windows. Staff had suggested that Riverlawn should be considered in a Williams Wharf Historic District rather than as an individual property. Consultant Dave Brown had provided staff with additional documentation fleshing out the local significance of both Murray and Burke and noted that Burke’s contributions would provide a particular point of focus for the nomination. Brown acknowledged that significant changes had been made to the house in the 1930s, but that some original materials had been located inside. Lahendro questioned why staff had assigned so few points on the rating sheet for the integrity of the resource if the replacement windows were the only cause for concern. He also noted that the incomplete survey of Mathews County does not allow staff to make an informed judgment as to the rarity of the resource. Joseph Reid, the homeowner, mentioned that the replacement windows are rope-slung and perhaps older than originally determined, and Wagner stated that this information might support the argument for the building’s overall integrity. With a motion from Mr. Lahendro and a second from Dr. Lanier, the Board voted to overturn the evaluation committee’s decision and recommended that the resource proceed to nomination, provided that questions about the building’s integrity are answered and the history is complete in the nomination.

Preliminary Information Applications

The following proposals were *endorsed*, unless otherwise noted, with the following comments:

Capital Region.....presented by Kristin Kirchen
Campbell’s Bridge Mill Worker Historic District, City of Petersburg/Chesterfield County, Petersburg Quad. #020-5567, Criteria A, C, possibly D

Chair Moore asked if the proposed nomination would address the ethnic history of the mill workers, and whether any races were represented other than African American. Consultant Marcus Pollard responded that the racial makeup of the area had changed over time, as early history documents the presence of white Scottish workers. After a consensus was reached that the district is eligible, Pollard noted the threat posed to the proposed district by planned Virginia State University development. The university plans to raze historic buildings in Upper Etrick by June 30, 2012, unless the buildings are moved south. Rob White, president of Historic Petersburg Foundation, noted that HPF is attempting to save

about fifteen of the buildings by moving them to Plum Street. The moved houses may have plaques identifying their former locations.

Farmer's Rest, Henrico County, Dutch Gap Quad, #043-0041, Criterion C

Owner Rhea Hale spoke briefly about the history of the property and informed the board that the former owner had freed his slaves and paid their passage back to Africa. Lahendro advised Hale that the aluminum siding should be taken off the house as soon as possible to prevent moisture from being trapped under the siding and damaging the original siding, which Hale said she was planning to have done.

Seay's Chapel, Fluvanna County, Arvonnia Quad, #032-0188, Criterion C

Three Chopt Road Historic District, City of Richmond, Bon Air Quad, #127-6064, Criterion C

Lahendro expressed interest in learning more about why the Three Chopt area evolved with unique architect-designed houses rather than following the guidelines of a platted subdivision like the Forest Hill neighborhood, though both were developed along streetcar routes. Moore asked why so many wealthy residents moved to the Three Chopt area. Kirchen answered that the neighborhood was seen as a kind of retreat from the city, with spacious lots set back from the street.

Northern Region.....presented by Joanie Evans

Apartment Bungalow and California Type Houses of Arlington County, MPD, #000-9712

Lahendro stated that while he had no objections to the proposed MPD, he hopes that any resulting districts will make a sufficient argument for distinctiveness apart from other twentieth century Arlington County neighborhoods. After comments were made about the extensive CLG and cost-share survey that has been done in Arlington County, the board members expressed interest in advocating for better survey in counties with the most need. Board members requested information about counties in the poorest state of survey.

Eastman-Fenwick House, Arlington County, Falls Church Quad, #000-4208-0191, Criteria B and C

Moore asked if Fenwick could be considered at statewide significance because of his role as a legislator. Evans responded that more research would have to be done into his biography.

Holly Knoll, Fairfax County, Seneca Quad, #029-0115, Criterion C

Lee asked if Ms. Carper's role in the house construction could qualify the property for Criterion B. Moore responded that Carper did not seem to have made a significant contribution to history, but that her involvement in construction was unusual and should be stressed in the nomination.

The State Review Board adjourned at 3:40 p.m.