

DRAFT MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

September 17, 2009, 10:00 a.m.

Virginia Historical Society, Halsey Lecture Hall, 428 North Boulevard, Richmond, VA 23221

State Review Board Members Present

Elizabeth Moore, Chair
Lauranett Lee, Vice-Chair
Gabrielle Lanier
John Metz
Jim Wootton

Historic Resources Board Members Present

Tad Thompson, Chair
Brian Broadus
Jeanne Evans
Carter Hudgins
Ora McCoy
Helen Murphy

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director
Ann Andrus
Francine Archer
Julie Constantino
David Edwards
Randy Jones
Kristin Kirchen
Jean McRae
Wendy Musumeci

Mike Pulice
Pam Schenian
Catherine Slusser
Susan Smead
Kelly Spradley-Kurowski
Elizabeth Tune
Marc Wagner
Joanna Wilson

State Review Board (SRB)

Chair Moore called the State Review Board meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. She read the role of the board, explaining the process of designation, and asked the other members to introduce themselves. The minutes from the June 2009 meeting were approved with a motion from Mr. Wootton and second from Dr. Lanier. There was no old or new business.

Historic Resources Board (HRB)

Chair Thompson called the Historic Resources Board meeting to order. He explained the role of the board and asked each member to introduce themselves. With a motion from Dr. Hudgins and second from Ms. Murphy the June 2009 minutes were approved. Under new business, Ms. Murphy nominated Ms. Evans for Vice-Chair, and the HRB voted unanimously after a second from Mr. Broadus. Then Ms. Murphy nominated Mr. Thompson to continue as Chair, and with Mr. Thompson abstaining, the HRB voted for his continued service after a second from Dr. Hudgins.

Director Kilpatrick read a resolution for the service of retired staff member, Mr. Calder Loth. With a motion from Mr. Metz and a second from Dr. Lee, the SRB voted to accept the resolution as read. Then with a motion from Dr. Hudgins and a second from Ms. Murphy, the HRB also voted to accept the resolution as read.

Director's Report (DHR)

Director Kilpatrick welcomed everyone in attendance. She asked the Board members to hold future dates for a training day and tour of Fort Monroe, as well as for the retirement party for Mr. Loth. Kilpatrick brought the Boards up to date on state budget cuts and impacts to DHR. She spoke of upcoming events and partnerships, and pointed out challenges on the agenda. Finally, Director Kilpatrick highlighted some initiative items from the agenda and introduced Dr. Slusser to present DHR's work plan for the support of the Boards. With a motion from Ms. Evans and a second from Dr. Hudgins, the HRB voted to support the work plan. And with a motion from Mr. Wootton and a second from Dr. Lee, the SRB also voted to support the work plan.

The Boards considered the following Register Nominations.

Ms. Kirchen presented the following nominations for the Capital Region:

Annefield, Charlotte County, #019-5208
Boyd Tavern, Albemarle County, #002-0085
First Battalion Virginia Volunteers Armory, Jackson Ward Historic District, City of Richmond, #127-5676
Four Locust Farm, Charlotte County, #019-5206

Grace Street Commercial Historic District Amendment and Boundary Increase, City of Richmond, #127-0857
Lewis Mountain, Albemarle County, #002-0923
MacCallum More and Hudgins House Historic District, Mecklenburg County, #186-5020
McGuffey School, City of Charlottesville, #104-0072-0300
Virginia Trunk and Bag Company, City of Petersburg, #123-5423

Comments made:

Ms. Murphy asked of the future plans for Annefield, and Ms. Kirchen said there had been restoration work to the main house and it was anticipated it would continue to the outbuildings.

With a motion from Dr. Lanier and a second from Dr. Lee, the SRB recommended all nine nominations for the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP), and with a motion from Ms. Murphy and second from Mr. Broadus, the HRB voted to list all the Capitol Region nominations into the Virginia Landmarks Register (VLR).

Mr. Edwards presented the following nominations for the Northern Region:

Floris Historic District, Fairfax County, #029-5179
Hillsboro Historic District, Boundary Increase, Loudoun County, #236-0040
Springs Valley Rural Historic District, Fauquier County – removed from the agenda due to a majority owner objection

Comments made:

Dr. Hudgins asked about the process that led to the current Hillsboro proposal, and Mr. Edwards explained that the nomination was submitted by the Town of Hillsboro, based on a joint Cost Share project. Ms. McRae gave the final numbers of objection by owners within the proposed boundary increase for consideration. Mr. Grigsby, a resident in the current listed boundaries of the Hillsboro district, presented the board with his concerns regarding the listing of the extended boundaries. Following discussion between Mr. Grigsby, staff and board member regarding the differences between state and national listing and local ordinances and zoning, Chair Thompson proposed the Boards postpone a vote on the Hillsboro proposal until further discussion during the public forum at the end of the joint agenda—a suggestion approved by both HRB (moved by Ms. Evans and seconded by Ms. Murphy) and the SRB (moved by Mr. Metz and seconded by Dr. Lanier).

Then with a motion from Dr. Hudgins and second from Ms. Evans, the HRB voted to list the Floris Historic District into the VLR, and with a motion from Mr. Wootton and a second from Dr. Lanier, the SRB recommended Floris for the NRHP.

Mr. Pulice presented the following nominations for the Roanoke Region:

Dan River Mill No. 8, City of Danville, #108-0123
Foster Falls Historic District, Wythe County, #098-5141
Honaker Commercial Historic District, Russell County, #239-5001
Willson House, Rockbridge County, #081-0183

With a motion from Dr. Lee and second from Mr. Metz, the SRB recommended all Roanoke Region nominations for the NRHP, and with a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Ms. Murphy, the HRB voted to list the four nominations into the VLR.

Ms. Schenian presented the following nominations for the Tidewater Region:

Historic and Architectural Resources of Hobson Village Multiple Property Submission, City of Suffolk, #133-5257
T.C. Walker House, Gloucester County, #036-5053
Virginia Ice and Freezing Company Cold Storage Warehouse, City of Norfolk, #122-5423

Comments made:

Mr. Wagner explained what the Hobson MPS document meant for the future listing of resources within the Suffolk Community, as well as the process of getting to this stage. Several community members spoke of their gratitude for the acknowledgement of Hobson and the work of the staff and Boards, including Ms. Mary Hill, Ms. Marie Hill, and Dr. Jackson.

With a motion from Dr. Lee and second from Dr. Lanier, the SRB voted to recommend the three Tidewater Region nominations to the NRHP. And with a motion from Ms. Evans and second from Dr. Hudgins, the HRB voted to list the two nominations and accept the MPS into the VLR. The Boards then took a ten minute recess before moving on to the public forum and action on the Hillsboro nomination.

Public Forum:

Mr. Queen, Mr. Fletcher, and Ms. Eicher, from the Springs Valley Rural HD proposed area, and Mr. Fallon, attorney representing Mr. Queen and Mr. Fletcher, spoke of their distrust of local proponents and local government involvement and use of the honorary state and federal historic district listing. They voiced objections to a process based on owner objection preferring active owner approval. They objected to the way owners are counted. All sought a board commitment to refuse to hear any further nominations from the Spring Valley area. Several Board members, as well as Director Kilpatrick, explained the role of the staff and Boards for review and nomination process and reiterated that this is strictly an honorary listing and recognition of resources.

Mr. Grigsby, Hillsboro resident, again presented his similar concerns and distrust of local government's intent. Several Board members and Director Kilpatrick explained the legal requirements which DHR staff and the Board members use to follow the process of listing, including notification and public comment.

Finally, with a motion from Dr. Hudgins and a second from Mr. Broadus, the HRB voted to list the Hillsboro Historic District Updated Nomination and Boundary Increase into the VLR. With a motion from Mr. Wootton and a second from Mr. Metz the SRB voted to recommend the nomination to the NRHP, and the Joint Session was adjourned for lunch.

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Chair Thompson brought the HRB back to order around 2:30 p.m. and Ms. Archer presented the following Highway Markers for approval.

Local Marker Text for Approval

The Bell Tower, Capitol Square, City of Richmond

With a motion from Dr. Hudgins and a second from Mr. Broadus the local marker text was approved.

September Highway Marker Texts

South Hill

Abram Frederick Biggers and Biggers School

Matoaca Mill Site

Diversity Markers (TEA-21)

John Cephas 1930–2009

Destruction of Chickahominy Indian Towns

First Williamsburg Gaol Inmates

Pamunkey Indians Attacked by Nathaniel Bacon

Ora Brown Stokes 1882 - 1957

With a motion from Ms. Evans and second from Ms. McCoy all the markers were approved.

Richmond Slave Trail Marker Program for Approval

Ms. Welliver and Mr. Pinnock from the City of Richmond presented the proposed marker program and, after answering some questions regarding Richmond's comparative role in slavery and the extent of resources along the trail, the HRB voted to approve the slave trail marker program with a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Mr. Broadus.

Ms. Musumeci then presented the following easement items:

Easement Donations to Consider

Bly Farm, Fisher's Hill Battlefield, Shenandoah County

Bowmans Mill Ford, Cedar Creek Battlefield, Warren County

Willow Run Farm, Brandy Station Battlefield, Culpeper County

Stilwell Farm, Brandy Station Battlefield, Culpeper County

Diehl Farm, Cross Keys Battlefield, Rockingham County

Curles Neck Farm, Henrico County

Bolling-Zimmer House/The Lawn, City of Petersburg

Easement Donations to Consider within the Port Royal Historic District, Caroline County

Gravatt House

Gravatt House Lots-Water Street

Riverview

Townfield-Frederick Street Lot

River Lots at Market & Water Streets

Easement Amendments to Consider

Corotoman Archaeological Site, Lancaster County (amend easement language and provisions)

Comments made:

Mr. Long of Port Royal thanked the Board and spoke of his desire to balance new development within the town while maintaining historic integrity and character. Then with a motion from Ms. Evans and second from Mr. Broadus all 13 easement items were accepted as recommended by DHR staff.

Ms. Musumeci presented a revised Policy #8 dealing with Easement Program Recordkeeping, and the Board voted to approve the updated policy with a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Mr. Broadus.

Finally Ms. Musumeci presented the following easement updates and recordings since the June 2009 board meeting.

Easement Updates

Clem-Kagey Farm, Shenandoah County

Mustering Grounds/Retirement, Abingdon, Washington County

Easements Recorded Since the June 2009 Meeting

Farmer's Bank, City of Petersburg

Pamplin Pipe Factory, Appomattox County

Buckland Tavern, Buckland Historic District, Prince William County

John Trone House, Buckland Historic District, Prince William County

Huntsberry Tract, Third Winchester Battlefield, Frederick County

Ingles Ferry Farm, Pulaski County

Gilmore Cabin, Montpelier, Orange County

Civil War Encampments, Montpelier, Orange County

Race Mills, Frederick County

The HRB adjourned by unanimous vote.

STATE REVIEW BOARD

Chair Moore brought the SRB to order around 2.15 p.m. in the Study Collections Room of the Department of Historic Resources for discussion and endorsement of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

Board Members (b) and Staff (s) present: Gabrielle Lanier (b), Laurant Lee (b), John Metz (b), Elizabeth Moore (b), Jim Wootton (b), Ann Andrus (s), David Edwards (s), Kristin Kirchen (s), Michael Pulice (s), Pam Schenian (s), Kelly Spradley-Kurowski (s), Marc Wagner (s).

Guests (from sign in sheet): Genevieve Keller, Elena Ellis, Andrew Ball (all for Greater Port Royal Rural Historic District), Mimi Sadler (Kent Road Apartments, Marshall Swain Wells MPD, 8 Dogwood Lane), Robert and Patty Costantino (Thomas Hutton's Message)

Preliminary Information Applications

The following proposals were endorsed, unless other wise noted, with the following comments:

1. Greater Port Royal Rural Historic District, Caroline, Essex, and King George Counties, DHR File Number 284-0044

The Board reviewed and approved of the slight boundary change made since the PIF was evaluated, to completely capture the parcels of one of the important properties in the district.

2. Kent Road Village Apartments, City of Richmond, DHR File Number 127-6514

Board and staff discussed the frequency of FHA apartments in Richmond, established in a previous MPD, and the board asked for discussion of any connection between the occupants and the apartments' architectural style.

3. The Work of Marshall Swain Wells Architect MPD, City of Charlottesville, DHR File Number 104-5154

The Board asked for clarification on the place of Wells among the many Colonial Revival architects in Virginia, specific justification of why his properties were eligible, and whether he influenced local architectural development.

4. 8 Dogwood Lane, Albemarle County, DHR File Number 002-5148

The Board asked for clarification in the nomination about the eligibility of this house compared to the numerous other Colonial Revival houses built for wealthy clients. The Board also noted that the landscape design was reminiscent of Fiske Kimball's work in Ann Arbor, MI, and recommended investigation of a possible connection.

5. Thomas Hutton's Messuage, Loudoun County, DHR File Number 053-0598

The Board recommended the inclusion of Criterion A, potentially for Social History.

6. George Washington Hotel, Winchester Historic District, City of Winchester, DHR File Number 138-0042-0919

The Board recommended better explanation of the hotel's architectural significance.

7. Western State Hospital, Boundary Increase, City of Staunton, DHR File Number 132-0009

The Board asked about proposed use of the barn.

8. Greenfield, Botetourt County, DHR File Number 011-0026

The Board commented that the property was deserving of recognition and recommended establishing the uniqueness of the resources within the county. Staff and board members discussed the archaeological potential and architectural significance of the property, and how best to encourage the County to preserve it.

9. Maxwellton, Rockbridge County, DHR File Number 081-0063

The Board suggested investigating possible connections to the Staunton Stuarts.

10. Saltville Battlefield Historic District, Smyth County, DHR File Number 295-5001

Staff and Board members discussed the rich archaeological resources in the district and expressed hope that the upcoming nomination would encourage their preservation.

11. Greenbrier Training School, King and Queen County, DHR File Number 049-5013

The Board had the following questions: Would like information on students, teachers, families that attended this school. How large was the region covered by this school? How many students attended it? How important was it to those students? Are there oral histories about the school experience? How important was it to the community? Any notable graduates?

12. Noland Company Office and Warehouse Building, City of Newport News, DHR File Number 121-0299

The Board noted that the significance and integrity of the building need to be established, as well as its historic association with the Noland Company. It asked how the changes to the building relate to its function, and whether trucks or rail were used to move shipments to and from the building.

13. 101 Tempsford Lane Apartments, City of Richmond, DHR File Number 127-6513

The Board asked about the amount of modern architecture in Virginia, and noted the following: Unique for its early Moderne style in Richmond. Besides this, and the building next door, did Hoppe continue to design Moderne buildings? What was Richmond's contemporary reaction to the building? Who first lived in the apartments? Did they appreciate the uniqueness of the building?

14. Blackburn House, Henrico County, DHR File Number 043-0062

The Board recommended substantiating the architectural information with an architectural historian.

15. Old Hall, Scottsville Historic District, Albemarle County, DHR File Number 298-0006; 298-0024-0006

The board noted that the gardens may have as much significance as the house, and asked about future plans for the house and gardens.

The State Review Board adjourned.