

FINAL MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

March 19, 2009, 10:00 a.m.

Virginia Historical Society, Halsey Lecture Hall, 428 North Boulevard, Richmond, VA 23221

State Review Board Members Present

Elizabeth Moore, Chair
Lauranett Lee, Vice-Chair
Jody Lahendro
John Metz
Jim Wootton

Historic Resources Board Members Present

Tad Thompson, Chair
Patrick Butler, Vice-Chair
Jeanne Evans
Carter Hudgins
Ora McCoy
Helen Murphy

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director
Ann Andrus
Francine Archer
Bob Carter
David Edwards
Randy Jones
Kristen Kirchen
Calder Loth
Jean McRae

Wendy Musumeci
Mike Pulice
Pam Schenian
Susan Smead
Jolene Smith
Kelly Spradley-Kurowski
Elizabeth Tune
Marc Wagner
Joanna Wilson

State Review Board (SRB)

Chair Moore called the State Review Board meeting to order shortly after 10 am and welcomed everyone in attendance. She read the role of the board, explaining the process of designation, and asked the other members to introduce themselves. The minutes from the December 2008 meeting were approved with a motion from Dr. Lee and a second from Mr. Wootton. There was no old or new business.

Historic Resources Board (HRB)

Chair Thompson called the Historic Resources Board meeting to order and welcomed everyone in attendance. He explained the role of the board and asked each member to introduce themselves. With a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Dr. Hudgins the December 2008 minutes were approved, with Ms. Evans abstaining as she was not in attendance at the last meeting. There was no old or new business.

Director's Report (DHR)

Director Kilpatrick welcomed everyone in attendance. She welcomed two of the three new State Review Board members to today's meeting. Kilpatrick brought the Boards up to date on program trends, the economy and the stimulus for Virginia, joint partnerships and setting standards, and Fort Monroe. Finally she updated the Boards on the Fifeville and Tonsler Neighborhoods Historic District nomination then highlighted items on the day's agenda.

Chair Thompson thanked Director Kilpatrick and DHR for all their work during the year, and then the Boards considered the following Register Nominations.

Ms. Kirchen presented the following nominations for the Capital Region:

Fairview, Amherst County, #005-0006
The Grove, Caroline County, #016-0012
Pharsalia, Nelson County, #062-0428
Shady Grove School, Louisa County, #054-0099

Comments made:

Ms. McCoy commented on the information within the Shady Grove School nomination.

Dr. Butler reminded staff and attending consultants to include some mention of current history about resources regardless of their ending Period of Significance date; and suggested adding some economic historical background to Fairview.

Dr. Lee asked about including Criterion A for the Grove nomination, and Ms. Kirchen said the consultant did what research they could but did not find sufficient enough information to fully make a case for Criterion A in addition to C at this time.

With a motion from Mr. Wootton and a second from Dr. Lee, the SRB approved all four Capital Region nominations, and with a motion from Dr. Butler and a second from Ms. McCoy, the HRB voted to list the four nominations into the VLR.

Mr. Edwards presented the following nominations for the Northern Region:

Bristersburg Historic District, Fauquier County, #030-5161

Broad Run/Little Georgetown Rural Historic District, Fauquier County, #030-5514

Chestnut Hill, Orange County, #275-0016

Commanding General's Quarters, Prince William County, #287-0010-0036

Idlewild, City of Fredericksburg, #111-0151

Sumerduck Historic District, Fauquier County, #030-5164

Woodlawn Quaker Meetinghouse, Fairfax County, #029-0172

Comments made:

Chair Thompson asked about the construction of the Woodlawn Meeting House, and Mr. Edwards clarified the two main portions were built in 1851 and 1869.

Ms. Murphy asked about future plans for Idlewild, and Mr. Nelson from the city explained that with the building now being stabilized, it would be sold with the agreement the buyer would restore and preserve the resource.

Dr. Butler mentioned that it would be nice to see the addition of a bit more information on each of the other commanding generals who lived at the Quarters.

Dr. Moore asked about the archaeological potential in the Broad Run nomination, and writer Mr. Brown said that at this point they were acknowledging all possible resources, which could then be surveyed and documented more thoroughly at another time.

With a motion from Dr. Lee and a second from Mr. Lahendro, the SRB voted to approve the seven nominations, and with a motion from Ms. Evans and a second from Ms. Murphy, the HRB voted to list the nominations into the VLR.

Mr. Pulice presented the following nominations for the Roanoke Region:

Barnard Farm, Patrick County, #070-5058

Danville Tobacco Warehouse Historic District, Boundary increase, City of Danville, #108-0058

Schoolfield School Complex, City of Danville, 108-5065-0081

West Fork Furnace, Floyd County, #031-0084

Comments made:

Mr. Wootton asked about the original exclusion of the two buildings now being added to the Danville district and Mr. Pulice explained that they were first considered part of a different district, but it was now thought they more appropriately belonged to the warehouse district.

With a motion from Mr. Wootton and a second from Mr. Metz, the SRB voted to approve the four nominations, and with a motion from Ms. McCoy and a second from Ms. Murphy the nominations were listed on the VLR by the HRB.

Ms. Schenian presented the following nominations for the Tidewater Region:

Bluff Point Graded School, Northumberland County, #066-5052

Ware Neck Store and Post Office, Gloucester County, #036-5016

B. Williams & Company Store, Mathews County, #057-0035

Comments made:

Ms. Evans asked the acreage proposed for the Williams Store listing, and Chair Thompson said he was glad to see the Ware Neck and Bluff Point School nominations coming forward. Speaking on behalf of the Mathews County Community Foundation, Mr. Ulsaker, spoke of the plans for the wharf area around the Williams Store and how appreciative the county was for the consideration of listing by the Boards and DHR staff. With a motion from Dr. Lee and a second from Mr. Wootton, the SRB voted to approve all three nominations, and with a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Ms. Evans, the HRB voted to list the three nominations into the VLR.

The Joint Session was adjourned as the Boards broke for lunch.

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Chair Thompson brought the HRB back to order shortly before 1:00 p.m. and Ms. Archer presented the following new Highway Markers for approval.

Civil War Action at Mathias Point
Historic Green Spring
Southern Albemarle Rural Historic District
First Confederate Officer Killed
Free Blacks of Israel Hill
Hargrave Military Academy

Diversity Markers (TEA-21)

Spotswood W. Robinson III
Hebrew Cemetery
Mary Cooke Branch Munford
Grace Evelyn Arents

Chair Thompson commented on the Israel Hill and Mary Munford markers, while Ms. Murphy said was glad to see the Grace Arents marker in the works. With a motion from Dr. Hudgins and a second from Dr. Butler the markers were all approved, and then Ms. Musumeci presented the following easements.

Easement Donations to Consider

Bowman-Zirkle Farm, Shenandoah County
Clem-Kagey Farm, Shenandoah County
Historic Jamestowne, Jamestown Island, James City County
The Grove, Caroline County
Olive Hill, Chesterfield County
Mustering Grounds/Retirement, Abingdon, Washington County
Lewiston Farm, Port Republic Battlefield, Rockingham County

After discussion back-and-forth between staff and HRB members regarding the two separate parcels of the Clem-Kagey Farm and the negotiations with the owners of both parcels up to now, Ms. Musumeci provided the DHR staff recommendations to the Board as follows: to accept easements as presented on the Bowman-Zirkle Farm, Historic Jamestowne, The Grove, Olive Hill, and the Lewiston Farm; accept an easement on the Clem-Kagey Farm with the condition both the 100.34 acre and 3.6 acre parcels be included; and accept the easement offer on the Mustering Grounds with the condition the Retirement property be included and both areas be listed on the VLR. With a motion from Ms. Murphy and a second from Ms. Evans, the Bowman-Zirkle Farm, Historic Jamestowne, The Grove, Olive Hill, and the Lewiston Farm easement offers were accepted. Then with a motion from Dr. Butler for DHR to continue negotiations with the landowners to include the adjacent parcels with the primary built historic resources in their easement offers and a second from Ms. McCoy, the Clem-Kagey Farm and Mustering Ground offers were approved. Ms. Musumeci then presented the following easement offers recorded since the December 2008 Board meeting.

Easements Recorded Since the December 2008 Meeting

Baird Tract, Battle of Reams Station, Dinwiddie County
Leslie Property, Aldie Battlefield, Loudoun County
Marmion, King George County
Pilgrim's Rest, Prince William County
Whitney Pound Tract, Brandy Station Battlefield, Culpeper County
Louis Pound Tract, Brandy Station Battlefield, Culpeper County
Claughton-Wright House, Northumberland County
Windsor Shades, King William County

The HRB adjourned with a motion from Dr. Butler and a second from Ms. Murphy.

STATE REVIEW BOARD

Chair Moore brought the SRB to order around 12.45 p.m. in the Study Collections Room of the Department of Historic Resources for discussion and endorsement of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

Board Members (b) and Staff (s) present: Joseph Lahendro (b), Laurant Lee (b), John Metz (b), Elizabeth Moore (b), Jim Wootton (b), Ann Andrus (s), Bob Carter (s), David Edwards (s), Kristin Kirchen (s), Michael Pulice (s), Pam Schenian (s), Kelly Spradley-Kurowski (s), Marc Wagner (s).

Guests (from sign in sheet): Suzanne Hudson plus four others (Hockley Farm); Sarah McPhail (Hylton Hall, Central High School, Virginia Trunk and Bag Company); Julie Clevenger (T.C. Walker House)

Preliminary Information Applications

All proposals were endorsed, with the following comments:

1. Hockley Farm, Gloucester County, DHR File Number 036-0024

2. Hylton Hall Home for Young Women, City of Danville, DHR File Number 108-5065-0082

Board comments: The Board asked about future plans for the property, and whether it was known why such differing architectural styles were used throughout the Schoolfield area. The consultant responded that no reason is currently known for the architectural style differentiation and that future plans included condominiums.

3. Central High School, Accomack County, DHR File Number 001-5065

Board comments: The board asked when the windows were boarded and future plans for the property.

4. Virginia Trunk and Bag Company, City of Petersburg, DHR File Number 123-5423

Board comments: The board asked about the location of the property compared to other Petersburg Historic Districts, and requested that information about the demographic make up of the employee base be included in the nomination. The board also requested information about the concentration level of the resources and the amount of modern infill construction, and whether the manufacturing process could be understood as related to each building.

5. Clem Farm, Shenandoah County, DHR File Number 085-0206

6. T.C. Walker House, Gloucester County, DHR File Number 036-5053

Board comments: The board requested that Criterion A be investigated for representation of the growth of the black middle and professional class in the Jim Crow era.

7. Bowman-Zirkle Farm, Shenandoah County, DHR File Number 085-0438

8. Buena Vista Downtown Historic District, City of Buena Vista, DHR File Number 103-5055

Board comments: The Board asked for clarification in the nomination about how the non-contributing resources affect the district's cohesion.

9. Pulaski Iron Company Spec Mine Facilities/Fringer Store, Botetourt County, DHR File Number 011-5143

Board comments: The Board requested information about archaeological potential of the property.

10. Samuel Gilmer House, Russell County, DHR File Number 083-0003

Board comments: The Board concurred with the staff's integrity concerns but agreed that potential for listing was present.

11. Windsor Apartments, City of Roanoke, DHR File Number 128-6164

12. Gibb-Montrose House, Accomack County, DHR File Number 001-5066

13. Sibley's General Store, Mathews County, DHR File Number 057-5048

14. Atlantic Coast Line Railroad Commercial and Industrial Historic District, City of Petersburg, DHR File Number 123-5424

Board comments: The Board agreed with the staff's recommendation to include the Virginia Trunk and Bag Company and the staff's concern about the later resources and their effects on the proposed boundaries. The Board also asked for thorough justification of the boundaries, and explanation of the reasons for alterations to many district resources—whether they had to do with its manufacturing significance or not.

15. Oak Grove, Goochland County, DHR File Number 037-0076

Board comments: The Board asked if it was known why the older section was so austere in appearance, and whether this could have had any relation to early dissident religions.

16. Pettus Dairy Farm/Four Locust Farm, Charlotte County, DHR File Number 019-5206

Board comments: The Board asked for clarification of the POS, and whether it would be more appropriate to begin in 1875. The Board also requested information on the workers at the complex, whether the tenant houses relate to the dairy operations, and explanation of how each building in the complex related to the process.

The State Review Board adjourned.