

FINAL MINUTES

JOINT MEETING of the STATE REVIEW BOARD and HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

June 18, 2009, 10:00 a.m.

Virginia Historical Society, Halsey Lecture Hall, 428 North Boulevard, Richmond, VA 23221

State Review Board Members Present

Elizabeth Moore, Chair
Lauranett Lee, Vice-Chair
Gabrielle Lanier
Jody Lahendro
John Metz
Jim Wootton

Historic Resources Board Members Present

Tad Thompson, Chair
Patrick Butler, Vice-Chair
Brian Broadus
Jeanne Evans
Carter Hudgins
Ora McCoy
Helen Murphy

Department of Historic Resources Staff Present

Kathleen Kilpatrick, Director
Ann Andrus
Francine Archer
Karen Brandt
Bob Carter
David Edwards
Joanie Evans
Calder Loth
Jean McRae

Wendy Musumeci
Mike Pulice
Pam Schenian
Catherine Slusser
Susan Smead
Kelly Spradley-Kurowski
Marc Wagner
Joanna Wilson

Historic Resources Board (HRB)

Chair Thompson called the Historic Resources Board meeting to order shortly after 10 am and welcomed everyone in attendance. He explained the role of the board and asked each member to introduce themselves. With a motion from Ms. Murphy and second from Dr. Butler the March 2009 minutes were approved. There was no old or new business.

State Review Board (SRB)

Chair Moore called the State Review Board meeting to order. She read the role of the board, explaining the process of designation, and asked the other members to introduce themselves. The minutes from the March 2009 meeting were approved with a motion from Dr. Lee and second from Mr. Lahendro. There was no old or new business.

Director's Report (DHR)

Director Kilpatrick welcomed everyone in attendance. She welcomed Dr. Lanier of the SRB, attending for the first time today. She said goodbye to long time HRB member, Dr. Butler, and thanked him for his service to Virginia and preservation; and then announced that staff member, Calder Loth, would be retiring from full time work with DHR on September 1, 2009. Kilpatrick brought the Boards up to date on some of the Governor's initiatives, challenges, and significant events. Finally, she commented on the continued high volume of resources being reviewed and today's full agenda then highlighted several items. Dr. Butler spoke of the early days of Board meetings and then thanked everyone for their dedication and continued work.

The Boards considered the following Register Nominations.

Ms. Andrus presented the following nominations for the Capital Region:

Atlantic Coast Line Railroad Commercial and Industrial Historic District, City of Petersburg, #123-5424
First Union School, Goochland County, #037-5016
Fort Mitchell Depot, Lunenburg County, #055-5097
Galt's Mill Historic District, Amherst County, #005-5037
Hopewell High School, City of Hopewell, #116-5030
Ninth Street Office Building, City of Richmond, #127-0180
Oak Grove, Goochland County, #037-0076
West Franklin Street Historic District, Boundary Increase, City of Richmond, #127-0228
Woodland Heights Historic District, City of Richmond, #127-0830
Zehmer Farm, Dinwiddie County, #257-5008

Comments made:

Mr. Glass, representing a client in the West Franklin Street Boundary Increase, spoke to object to the listing and asked why this area was being considered when so many resources were non-historic. Chair Thompson, HRB, responded that listing is honorific and does not impede on any owners rights, but offers tax credits or other benefits to those wishing to take advantage of them to enhance the area. DHR Director Kilpatrick added that non-historic buildings would most likely be counted as non-contributing meaning that they did not fit within the context of the nomination but only fell within the necessary boundaries to capture all the possible contributing resources.

Councilman Moore spoke on behalf of all elected officials for the City of Petersburg and noted their full consent to list the Atlantic Coast Line RR Commercial and Industrial Historic District.

Mr. Lahendro, SRB, asked about the process for requesting more context, and Mr. Wagner, DHR, responded that the Boards' comments made prior to the meeting would all be considered and acted upon following the meeting.

Owners and representatives for the First Union School, Woodland Heights Historic District, and Zehmer Farm nominations all stood to be recognized and thanked the staff and board members for their consideration.

Chair Moore, SRB, asked and confirmed the ending date for the period of significance of the Fort Mitchell Depot at 1956.

With a motion from Ms. Murphy and second from Ms. McCoy, the HRB voted to list all the Capitol Region nominations into the Virginia landmarks Register (VLR), and with a motion from Mr. Wootton and a second from Dr. Lee, the SRB recommended all ten nominations for the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP).

Dr. Spradley-Kurowski presented the following nomination for the Northern Region:

Lexington Site, Fairfax County, #029-5612

Ms. Evans presented the following nominations for the Northern Region:

Bowman-Zirkle Farm, Shenandoah County, #085-0438

Clem-Kagey Farm, Shenandoah County, #-85-0206

Crab Run Lane Truss Bridge, Highland County, #045-0032

Farmer's Delight Nomination Update and Boundary Decrease, Loudoun County, #053-0121

Orlean Historic District, Fauquier County, #030-5159

Rock Hill, Loudoun County, #053-1057

South East Street Historic District, Town of Culpeper, #204-0064

Woodside, Fauquier County, #030-0059

Comments made:

Ms. Murphy, HRB, asked why the Farmer's Delight updated nomination was also a decrease to the acreage, and a representative for the property, Mr. Berger, explained the spilt in ownership and broken connection of the lands surrounding the main resources since the property was originally listed.

Ms. Keller, representing the South East Street Historic District, stood to be recognized and thanked the staff and Boards for their consideration of this nomination.

With a motion from Dr. Butler and second from Dr. Hudgins, the HRB voted to list all the Northern Region nominations into the VLR, and with a motion from Dr. Lanier and a second from Dr. Lee, the SRB recommended all nine nominations for the NRHP.

Mr. Pulice presented the following nominations for the Roanoke Region:

Anderson-Doosing Farm, Roanoke County, #080-0009

Buena Vista Downtown Historic District, City of Buena Vista, #103-5055

Hylton Hall, City of Danville, #108-5065-0082

Liberty Hall, Bedford County, #009-0013

Valley Railroad Bridge, City of Salem, #129-5023

Comments made:

Ms. Murphy, HRB, asked what Hylton Hall would be used for and Ms. Pollard, the consultant, said the plan is for high-end senior apartments.

With a motion from Ms. McCoy and second from Ms. Murphy, the HRB voted to list all the Roanoke Region nominations into the VLR, and with a motion from Dr. Lee and a second from Mr. Lahendro, the SRB recommended all five nominations for the NRHP.

Ms. Schenian presented the following nominations for the Tidewater Region:

American Cigar Company, City of Norfolk, #122-0658
Simon Reid Curtis House, City of Newport News, #121-5031
Eastville Historic District, Northampton County, #214-0040
Providence, King and Queen County, #049-0063
Warden Home, City of Chesapeake, #131-0093
Whittaker Memorial Hospital, City of Newport News, #121-5072

Comments made:

Dr. Butler, HRB, asked the future plans for the Whitaker Memorial Hospital and Ms. White, owner, said she hopes for senior housing. Ms. White also wanted to point out that the hospital was the only African-American engineered building in the U.S. at the time of its construction.

Ms. Evans, HRB, asked after the American Cigar Building and Ms. Pollard, the consultant, said the plan is for affordable apartments.

Chair Thompson, HRB, asked why Criterion B was not used in the Providence nomination, and Mr. Stuart, owner, responded, that with all the research, both documented and hearsay, he really wanted to focus on the resource's importance as a rare surviving example of early-19th century plantation and agricultural architecture for the region.

With a motion from Ms. Evans and second from Dr. Hudgins, the HRB voted to list the first five Roanoke Region nominations into the VLR. With a motion from Dr. Butler and second from Ms. Murphy, the HRB voted to list the Whitaker Memorial Hospital into the VLR contingent to the ownership being verified as Ms. Delphine White by DHR staff, due to a developing party's objection.

With a motion from Mr. Metz and second from Dr. Lanier, the SRB voted to recommend the first five Tidewater Region nominations to the NRHP. And with a motion from Mr. Lahendro and second from Dr. Lee, the SRB voted to recommend to the NRHP the Whitaker Memorial Hospital based on the above referenced contingency.

The Joint Session was adjourned as the Boards broke for lunch.

HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Chair Thompson brought the HRB back to order around 1:30 p.m. and Ms. Archer presented the following Highway Markers for approval.

Crossroads to War
Boyd Tavern
The Campaign of 1781—Lafayette's Maneuvers
Sandston Village

Diversity Markers (TEA-21)

Dr. Mary Edwards Walker
King William Training School
Ella Baker
Pearl Bailey
Indian Prisoners Abandoned on Tangier Island
William Henry Lewis

Replacement Markers (TEA-21)

Belvoir, E-60
Fort Belvoir, E-64
Action at Bristoe Station, G-19
Battle of Bristoe Station, G-20
Cavalry Affairs, N-5

Dr. Butler suggested on using the words ‘among the first’ instead of ‘the first’ on the Sandston Village marker. Ms. Evans congratulated Ms. Archer on the great job done to produce these markers. Dr. Hudgins suggested looking producing markers along the ‘Freedom’ bus lines and at bus stops in the next few years. With a motion from Dr. Hudgins and second from Ms. Murphy all markers were approved, then Ms. Musumeci presented the following easements.

Easement Donations to Consider

Caleb Rector House, Atoka Historic District, Fauquier County
Saint Luke’s Church, Isle of Wight County
Old Stone House, City of Richmond
B. Williams & Co. Store, Mathews County
Beth Elon, Henrico County
Gilmore Cabin and Civil War Tract, Montpelier, Orange County

Comments made:

Ms. Murphy commented on the recent restoration work completed by the Garden Club of America on the Saint Luke’s Church grounds. Dr. Hudgins, Dr. Butler and Ms. Musumeci discussed the dendrochronolgy research done to clarify the church’s actual construction date as compared to the beginning of the parish. Ms. Musumeci stated that the results of the dendrochronology study would be forthcoming and the easement baseline documentation would incorporate the recent research and documented dates.

Director Kilpatrick asked that Polly Gilmore, wife of George Gilmore, be equally acknowledged in the easement document for the Gilmore Cabin Tract. Chair Thompson asked why the National Trust for Historic Preservation was donating an easement on the Gilmore Cabin and Civil War Tracts, and Ms. Musumeci responded that it was the result of a Virginia Land Conservation Foundation grant agreement. She also added that more of the open -space land surrounding Montpelier would also be placed under easement with the Virginia Outdoors Foundation.

With a motion from Dr. Butler and second from Dr. Hudgins all six easement considerations were accepted.

Easement Amendments to Consider

Windsor Castle, Smithfield, Isle of Wight County

Comments made:

Dr. Hudgins asked what baseline documentation had been provided so far, and Ms. Musumeci detailed the rehabilitation plans for all areas including those outside the easement boundary, as the amendment includes the ability for DHR staff to review and have input on the surrounding park areas as well as the eased area. Dr. Hudgins suggested DHR having a field school and working with Mr. Lounsbury from Colonial Williamsburg on the documentation of the projects. Ms. Evans asked about the material for the pedestrian paths, and both Ms. Musumeci and Director Kilpatrick assured her that the materials would be appropriate for low-impact pedestrian only traffic. Dr. Hudgins asked about the town’s involvement and Director Kilpatrick said the owner had sold the outer area and donated the eased area to the town, and that everyone involved was committed to the preservation of the properties.

With a motion from Ms. McCoy and second from Ms. Evans the Windsor Castle amended easement was accepted.

Easements Recorded Since the March 2009 Meeting

Franklin & Armfield Office, City of Alexandria
Woodrow Wilson Birthplace, City of Staunton
Hurstville and Cress Field, Northumberland County
Mason-Dorton School, Russell County
Edmondson Hall, Meadowview, Washington County

Comments made:

Director Kilpatrick noted the Mason-Dorton School was the first easement in Russell County, Virginia.

Chair Thompson corrected the names of the donors for the Hurtsville and Cress Field easement as William T. Thompson III, Jessie T. Krusen, and Addison B. Thompson rather than "Thompson Family, LLC."

The HRB adjourned with a motion from Ms. Evans and second from Ms. Murphy.

STATE REVIEW BOARD

Chair Moore brought the SRB to order around 1.30 p.m. in the Study Collections Room of the Department of Historic Resources for discussion and endorsement of the Preliminary Information Applications (informal guidance session).

Board Members (b) and Staff (s) present: Joseph Lahendro (b), Gabrielle Lanier (b), Laurant Lee (b), John Metz (b), Elizabeth Moore (b), Jim Wootton (b), Ann Andrus (s), Bob Carter (s), David Edwards (s), Joanie Evans (s), Michael Pulice (s), Pam Schenian (s), Kelly Spradley-Kurowski (s), Marc Wagner (s).

Guests (from sign in sheet): Trish Strat, Carol Cross, Helen Cramond, Sue Baruch, Maryan Smigh, Maryan D. Smith (Vale Schoolhouse); Josephine Thorpe (Donk's Theater); John Hutchinson (Auburn Battlefields); Joyce Pritchard, Barney McLaughlin (Parkside Apartments); Jim and Becky Stilwell (High Banks); Paige and Marcus Pollard, Sarah McPhail, Paul Battaglia (VA Ice and Freezing Warehouse)

Preliminary Information Applications

All proposals were *endorsed*, unless otherwise noted, with the following comments:

1. Auburn Battlefields, Fauquier County, DHR File Number 030-5140

The Board asked if archaeological investigation had taken place, and Mr. Hutchinson confirmed that it had. DHR staff confirmed that the battlefield had lost integrity in its northern section, but that the rest of the battlefield appeared intact.

2. Vale School, Fairfax County, DHR File Number 029-5615

The board encouraged the nomination authors to take care not to focus on the female students to the exclusion of the male students who also attended the school. Board, staff, and property representatives discussed the possibility of including Agriculture as an AOS, and how to address the context of dairy farming and its decline in Fairfax County.

3. Donk's Theatre, Mathews County, DHR File Number 057-0069

The Board asked if the theater ever had segregated entrances; the theater's owner confirmed that it had not. The owner also clarified the location of the school and staff noted that this would result in revised mapping in DHR files.

4. High Banks, Frederick County, DHR File Number 034-0109

The Board cautioned that discrepancies in construction date be resolved in the nomination.

5. Virginia Ice and Freezing Corporation Cold Storage Warehouse, City of Norfolk, DHR File Number 122-5423

After receiving confirmation that the warehouse would be converted to residential space, the Board cautioned that the architectural details and construction materials, such as the use of cork and the lack of windows, were critical to understanding the building's use as a cold storage warehouse and should be considered carefully in future use. The consultants also reported that since the PIF was written, better construction date information had been located, which indicates that most of the complex was built contemporaneously.

6. Parkside Apartments, City of Hopewell, DHR File Number 116-5036

The property's owner was present to explain the significant interior damage and how much historic material had to be removed as a result of the fire and water damage. The Board discussed integrity concerns and the potential importance of social history for this property. As the owner's primary goal is gaining eligibility for the tax credit program, Board and staff suggested that he get informal guidance from tax credit staff as to whether there is sufficient historic material remaining to qualify, before conducting further research. Staff also suggested the 10% Federal credit available for rehabilitation of buildings constructed before 1936. The Board concurred with the staff recommendation of do not proceed to listing.

7. Streamline Moderne Houses in Arlington Multiple Property Submission, Arlington County, DHR File Number 000-9708

8. Earle M. Winslow House, Arlington County, DHR File Number 000-2633

9. Stone House, Loudoun County, DHR File Number 053-5471

10. Sydenstricker School, Fairfax County, DHR File Number 029-0154

Board Comments: The Board recommended the addition of Social History as an Area of Significance.

11. Thomas Hutton's Messuage, Loudoun County, DHR File Number 053-0598

Board Comments: Citing concerns about the property's integrity and the need to clarify what interior material is original and what has changed, the board recommended that an eligibility recommendation be **deferred**, pending better photographs or a staff site visit.

12. Wakefield Manor Garden Apartments, Arlington County, DHR File Number 000-5837

Board Comments: The Board asked for clarification of the status of the third building mentioned in the PIF, which had not been included in the evaluation.

13. Hassinger House, Town of Abingdon, Washington County, DHR File Number 140-0111

14. Sunnydale Farm, Wise County, DHR File Number 097-0403

15. Cedar Grove, Mecklenburg County, DHR File Number 058-0006

Board Comments: The Board cautioned that research on the genesis of the house's architecture would be important for the forthcoming nomination.

16. Daughters of Zion Cemetery, City of Charlottesville, DHR File Number 104-5153

Board Comments: SRB member Lee reported that she had been in contact with historians in Charlottesville who were looking for more information on the Daughters of Zion and the activities of mutual aid societies in Charlottesville, that might be of help in writing the nomination.

17. Harper's Mill Complex, Campbell County, DHR File Number 015-0070

The State Review Board adjourned.